

***Oak Park and River Forest High School
District 200***

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

TO: Board of Education

FROM: Cheryl Witham – Assistant Superintendent for Finance and Operations
Ron Johnson – Director of Purchasing and Transportation

DATE: April 16, 2013

RE: Executive Summary for Athletic Training Services - RFP

Background:

Since 2006, the District has been using AthletiCo for Athletic Training Services. The District is currently in a three-year contract with AthletiCo that expires June 16, 2013. The District has a contracted price of \$65,388.81 each year; totaling \$196,166.43 for the three-year contract. Since Athletic Training Services are exempted from bid law, a public RFP process was decided to ensure that the District is receiving the highest-quality service at a competitive price.

On April 2, 2013, proposals were received for Athletic Training Services from two vendors; AthletiCo and NovaCare. Two other vendors were solicited, A.T.I and Accelerated; however they did not submit a proposal. The proposal price for AthletiCo remained the same for each year of the contract; \$65,388.81 each year totaling \$196,166.43 for the three-years of the contract. The proposal price for NovaCare was \$42,300 each year; totaling \$126,900 for the three-year contract. The difference in initial proposal pricing was \$69,266.43 over the three-year contract.

After the RFP opening, the District Evaluation Committee convened to review the proposals from both vendors to ensure comparable service. During the review, there were questions about NovaCare's proposal and their resources available to provide service, per the RFP Specifications, to the District. To ensure AthletiCo and NovaCare's service was comparable, the Purchasing Coordinator had NovaCare in for a meeting, on April 3, 2013, with the District Evaluation Committee so they could address any questions or concerns. The outcome of this meeting was positive and the District Evaluation Committee was able to receive answers to their questions and concerns.

Since the District has a long-standing relationship with AthletiCo, the Purchasing Coordinator contacted AthletiCo to see if they were willing to adjust their proposal to make them more competitive with NovaCare's pricing. On April 5, 2013, AthletiCo submitted a revised proposal price of \$50,000 per year totaling \$150,000 for three years. The Purchasing Coordinator informed NovaCare of the change to keep competition equal. Since AthletiCo had the chance to revise their proposal, equal opportunity would be given to NovaCare. On April 10, 2013, NovaCare submitted a revised proposal price of \$38,000 per year totaling \$114,000 for three years. The revised proposed pricing from AthletiCo is \$46,166.43 less for three years than we are currently paying for Athletic Training Services. The revised proposed pricing from NovaCare is \$82,166.43 less for three years than we are currently paying for Athletic Training Services.

Oak Park and River Forest High School

District 200

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

Term of the contract:

Beginning: 6/10/2013 **Ending:** 6/15/2016

- ❖ *The District reserves the right to negotiate up to two (2) additional one-year extensions, to be signed no later than February 15th of each school year*

Summary of Findings:

1. Selection Criteria - The District Evaluation Committee comprised of the Athletic Director, Assistant Athletic Director and the Director of Purchasing and Transportation; reviewed the vendor proposals to determine which Athletic Training Service met the specifications outlined in the RFP packet.

The District Evaluation Committee applied the following formula as the means for recommending an appropriate vendor to the Board of Education:

Section 1: Technical Score (Maximum possible score 50 points)

- a. The three following proposal components will be reviewed by the District Evaluation Committee:
 - 1) Experience of staff to be assigned to the District.
 - 2) Technical abilities of vendor.
 - 3) Value added services
- b. The following two components, will be determined through vendor reference research and analysis performed by the Director of Purchasing and Transportation:
 - 1) Vendor relations (timely response to billing questions, accurate billing, ability to perform to contract specifications)
 - 2) Operational relations (communication with District staff, ability to follow directions, organization of staff, quality of services performed)

Section 2: Cost Score (Maximum possible score of 50 points)

- a. Computed by subtracting from a vendor's maximum possible cost score an amount equal in points to the percentage represented by the difference in that vendor's total proposal cost from that of the proposal of the lowest total cost to the District.
- b. For example, Proposal A is priced at \$3.33 and Proposal B is priced at \$3.00. In this case, Proposal B would be the "low-cost" proposal, earning 100% of the possible 50 points. Proposal A's cost is 10% higher than the lowest proposal cost, therefore Proposal A is penalized by a 10% point reduction and earns 90% of the possible points, 45 points.

The categorical weights are 50% cost, 30% district committee evaluation and 20% reference research and analysis.

Oak Park and River Forest High School

District 200

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

2. Cost Summary - AthletiCo submitted a revised proposal price of \$50,000 per year totaling \$150,000 for three years. NovaCare submitted a revised proposal price of \$38,000 per year totaling \$114,000 for three years. The proposed pricing from AthletiCo is \$46,166.43 less for three years while NovaCare is \$82,166.43 less for three years than we are currently paying for Athletic Training Services.
3. Committee Evaluation - The District Evaluation Committee rated the proposals on three key requirements; 1) Staff Experience 2) Technical Abilities 3) Value-Added Services. For staff experience, the District Evaluation Committee rated AthletiCo and NovaCare on years of providing Athletic Training Services in the Chicagoland area for High Schools, average years of experience for athletic trainers assigned to high schools and the number of Physical Therapists that are available to the District. For Technical Abilities, the District Evaluation Committee rated AthletiCo and NovaCare on their ability to do body fat testing, CPR/AED certifications, sports nutrition knowledge, IMPACT concussion testing, Emergency Action Plan Management and supply inventory management. . For Value-Added Services, the District Evaluation Committee rated AthletiCo and NovaCare on their ability to offer free injury screenings, willingness to be an official sponsor of the District, offer their preferred vendor discounts on Athletic Training supplies, conduct coaches training sessions, provide a team physician at all home football games and massage therapy appreciation days for district employees.
4. Reference Research and Analysis - The Purchasing Coordinator contacted all references provided from AthletiCo and NovaCare and asked them to rate them on the following two components. A scale of 1 – 10 was used; 1 being the lowest/worst and 10 being the highest/best:
 - Vendor Relations - timely response to billing questions, accurate billing and ability to perform to contract specifications,
 - Operational Relations - communication with District staff, ability to follow directions, organization of staff and quality of services performed

The feedback received from the references was very positive for both AthletiCo and NovaCare. Attached to this memo are the comments from the references.

5. Summary of Results and Scoring Matrix - Attached to this memo is the scoring matrix that summarizes the ratings for the Athletic Training Services proposals reviewed by the District Evaluation Committee and proposed costs associated with the purchase of Athletic Training Services. The District Evaluation Committee is recommending purchasing Athletic Training Services from NovaCare based on the outcome of the scoring matrix.

***Oak Park and River Forest High School
District 200***

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

Policies, regulations or laws the Board should be aware of in consideration of this approval and purchase. N/A

Recommendation

For information only at this time. The Board of Education will be asked to approve the Athletic Training Services contract being recommended at the regular Board of Education meeting scheduled for April 25, 2013.

***Oak Park and River Forest High School
District 200***

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

Contents

PROPOSAL PRICING SUMMARY 2
REFERENCE RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS 3
REFERENCE FEEDBACK 4
SCORING MATRIX..... 5
COST COMPARISON 5

***Oak Park and River Forest High School
District 200***

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

PROPOSAL PRICING SUMMARY

Company	2013 - 2014 Cost	2014 - 2015 Cost	2015 - 2016 Cost	Total Three Year Cost	Hourly Rate for Additional Services
Athletico	\$65,388.81	\$65,388.81	\$65,388.81	\$196,166.43	\$22.00
NovaCare	\$42,300.00	\$42,300.00	\$42,300.00	\$126,900.00	\$25.00
Revised AthletiCo (4/5/2013)	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$150,000.00	\$22.00
Revised NovaCare (4/10/2013)	\$38,000.00	\$38,000.00	\$38,000.00	\$114,000.00	\$22.00

Oak Park and River Forest High School District 200

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

REFERENCE RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS

Vendor	Vendor Relations	Operational relations
Athletico	9.67	9.67
NovaCare	9.42	9.33

Vendor	Reference	Vendor relations	Operational relations
Athletico	Lake Park High School	10	10
Athletico	Lemont High School	10	10
Athletico	Homewood-Flossmor District 233	10	10
Athletico	Metea Valley High School	8	8
Athletico	Glenbard District 87	10	10
Athletico	OPRFHS Athletic Department	10	10

Vendor	Reference	Vendor relations	Operational relations
NovaCare	Willowbrook High School	10	10
NovaCare	York High School	9	9
NovaCare	Depaul University	8.5	9
NovaCare	University of Illinois at Chicago	10	10
NovaCare	York High School	10	10
NovaCare	Loyola University	9	8

Note: York High School has two references because there was a change in Athletic Directors at York in December of 2012. The previous Athletic Director was at York during the change to NovaCare from their previous vendor and the interim Athletic Director has experience working with NovaCare currently.

***Oak Park and River Forest High School
District 200***

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

REFERENCE FEEDBACK

AthletiCo -

- Glenbard D87 - Vendor relations have been very good, timely accurate billing, execute to contract specs.
- Metea Valley HS - They have been great for us 4 years. We have had only one significant parent issue. Communication is good all the way around.
- Homewood Flossmoor HS - There has never been an issue with billing in terms of timeliness or accuracy. They have been very flexible whether helping to cover events at the last moment and/or following the contract. Our trainer from AthletiCo is very professional. He has started a student trainer program at our school and works well with our kids and coaches.
- Lemont HS - First class organization with highly trained and qualified Athletic Trainers
- Lake Park HS - We are a two-campus high school and contract for 3 full time athletic trainers. They are knowledgeable, professional, and are viewed by the coaching staff and our administration as integral members of our team.

NovaCare -

- York HS - Outstanding company. You will be very satisfied.
- York HS - Have provided the great care and treatment of our Athletic teams. Along with their supervisor, Noreen Karadsheh have been a delight to work with.
- UIC - We couldn't be happier with NovaCare, especially in their communication. Their quality of service, headed by our direct contact, Noreen Karadsheh, is outstanding.
- Willowbrook HS - NovaCare has been unbelievable. I have not one complaint with their services. They have been great to work with.

Note: Noreen Karadsheh is Director of Sports Medicine for NovaCare

Oak Park and River Forest High School

District 200

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

SCORING MATRIX

Athletic Trainer RFP Scoring Matrix			Vendors	
Category	Features/ Requirements		AthletiCo	NovaCare
1_Cost	Based on Proposals Submitted		6.84	10.00
2_Committee Evaluation	Staff Experience		10.00	2.42
2_Committee Evaluation	Technical Abilities		10.00	7.00
2_Committee Evaluation	Value-Added Services		10.00	5.79
3_References	Vendor Relations		9.67	9.42
3_References	Operational Relations		9.67	9.33
1_Cost Score			34.2	50.0
2_Committee Evaluation Score			30.0	15.2
3_References Score			19.3	18.8
Total Score			83.5	<u>84.0</u>

COST COMPARISON

Vendor	Cost	Rank	Lowest Proposal	% Penalty	Overall Cost Score
Athletico	\$150,000.00	2	\$114,000.00	31.58%	68.42%
NovaCare	\$114,000.00	1	\$114,000.00	0.00%	100.00%

Oak Park and River Forest High School

District 200

201 North Scoville Avenue • Oak Park, IL 60302-2296

TO: Ron Johnson
FROM: John Stelzer
DATE: April 10, 2013
RE: Athletic Training Services RFP

Please find below information and rationale for the recommendation to continue our current relationship with AthletiCo for athletic training services at OPRFHS.

1) Quality and experience of current athletic trainers

- Trainer, Shannon Wyatt has been assigned to OPRFHS for the past seven years
- Trainer, Dave Heidloff has been assigned to OPRFHS for the past four years
- Both trainers have relocated to Oak Park, in order to be more ingrained in the school and community, and each has over nine (9) years of athletic training experience
- Both trainers are available during off hours for students, athletes and parents (e.g. came into school at 7:00am recently to assess an injured student)
- Shannon volunteers her time in the school's Best Buddy Program
- Shannon is the recipient of the school's "Courageous Huskie Award"
- Proactive approach to the Athletic Training services for OPRFHS, and the unique needs of athletes, parents and coaches within our community

2) Value added services

- Strength & Conditioning and Dynamic Stretching Program for our entire athletic program, which has decreased injuries over the past three (3) years
- AthletiCo provides additional sponsorship revenue to the school and athletic department through the Stadium and Field House sponsor programs
- Huskie Healthy Lifestyle Night – provide presenters on various topics for students and parents
- Helped develop and manage the school's Concussion Management Program
- Provided pro-bono skin checks and preventive medicine for wrestling program
- Developed and manage the student athletic training program
- Volunteer trainer services for various school events, e.g. Huskiepalooza, Powder Puff football

3) Relationship Building

- Our trainers have weekly hours with our team Physician group, Midwest Orthopedics, this allows our students/families priority appointments (e.g. families without insurance are able to get an appointments and services on the same day due to our trainer's relationship with doctors)
- Numerous situations where our trainers have met families at emergency rooms, doctors offices, etc., after hours to ensure that the student and family were informed and felt assured of the care that was being provided