

**OAK PARK AND RIVER FOREST HIGH SCHOOL
201 N. Scoville
Oak Park, IL 60302**

**Finance Committee Meeting Minutes
April 16, 2013**

A Finance Committee meeting was held on Tuesday, April 16, 2013. Ms. McCormack called the meeting to order at 8:46 p.m. in the Second Floor Library East. Committee members present were Terry Finnegan, Valerie J. Fisher, Dr. Ralph H. Lee, Amy McCormack, Dr. Dietra D. Millard, Sharon Patchak-Layman, and John Phelan. Also present were Dr. Steven T. Isoye, Superintendent; Michael Carioscio, Chief Information Officer; Dr. Tina Halliman, Assistant Superintendent of Student Services; Amy Hill, Director of Assessment and Research; Philip M. Prale, Assistant Superintendent for Curriculum and Instruction; Nathaniel L. Rouse, Principal; Cheryl L. Witham, Assistant Superintendent for Finance and Operations; Karin Sullivan, Director of Community Relations and Communications; and Gail Kalmerton, Executive Assistant/Clerk of the Board.

Visitors included James Paul Hunter, Faculty Senate Executive Committee Chair; Mary Haley, League of Voters, Jason Bannack, Michael Drallo, Dave Heidloff, Peter Osver, Susan Rowe and Shannon Wyatt of AthletiCo ; Cathy Yen of the Boosters; Pat & David Bates of Cara's Staffing Co.; Dr. Bernie Bach, Alana Breen, Thomas F. Cofsky, Steve Gevinson, Lisa Neumann, Joel Press, Gayle Rosenthal, Steve Schaffer, Sue Schreck, Carole Smith, Traci Smith, Donna Weigel, Tim Weinard, Jeff Weissglass, Becky Williams, community members; Noreen Karadshen of NovaCare; Al Allen, Paul Collins, JP Coughlin, John Hoerster, Chris Ledbetter, Matt Maloney, Mike Powell, Paul Wright Robert Zummallen, Matt Kirkpatrick, Micheline Piekarski of OPRFHS; and Terry Dean of the Wednesday Journal.

Public Comments

Cathy Yen, resident of 1021 S. Grove, Oak Park and chair of Boosters, spoke on behalf of Boosters, and particularly the Boosters' board, who were delighted with the AthletiCo trainers' professionalism and efficiency. One thing that is of particular note is the trainer's own selection of continuing medical education courses in order to support the needs of Huskie athletics. These trainers know the parents and the doctors. Trainers are considered among the critical adults that students can go to talk about their feelings. Students go first to their coaches then their trainers and then their counselors or administrators. Trainers are the student's first impression of the school. She hoped the Board of Education placed as much value on them as does the Boosters.

Noreen Karadsheh, representative of NovaCare Rehabilitation, stated that NovaCare was excited to have the opportunity to represent OPRFHS. While AthletiCo is a great company, NovaCare feels it has given OPRFHS an excellent opportunity, its references have checked out, and it would do a great job for it.

JP Coughlin, resident of 1005 S. Lyman, Oak Park and the girls' basketball coach, shared a story about the level of trust that coaches have for the trainer's opinions. If coaches are told a student cannot play, they do not play.

Matt Maloney, resident of 1110 S. Euclid, Oak Park, varsity basketball coach, teacher, and former athlete, testified to the AthletiCo's trainers commitment and professionalism. Dave and Shannon, AthletiCo's two trainers at OPRFHS, are the most professional and compassionate individuals he has seen in 22 years. They make themselves available at all times to perform any service asked of the students or the coaches. They have had a great impact on the lives of many people.

Paul Collins, resident of 517 Thomas, Forest Park and a member of the OPRFHS coaching community, remembered thinking before AthletiCo started that the coaches believed the trainers they had been

working with were the best, but after working with the two AthletiCo trainers, Dave and Shannon, they felt differently. They found them to work tirelessly with a variety of wrestler and football players, making sure athletes followed up with doctor's appointments, and their PT appointments. Students are told to build relationships with adults in the building; students look up to the trainers. They are part of the community and they have done tremendous work for the community, the school, and the athletes.

Paul Wright, resident of 1110 S. Euclid, Oak Park, had forwarded emails from parents to the Board of Education in support of AthletiCo from parents. He had testified to the trainers' commitment to the parents and students. They make students feel safe and that is priceless. They are "Those Things That Are Best"

Lisa Neuman, resident of 526 West Augusta, Oak Park and parent of 3 student athletes and a personal trainer, also supported the AthletiCo trainers. She did not know what was broken or what needed to be fixed, and she felt safety should be first.

John Hoerster, resident of 612 S. Euclid, Oak Park, and head football coach, testified as to the capability of the trainers and the trust that the coaches have in their expertise. He too spoke about them building relationships with the students and he felt it would be an unfortunate mistake not to have them here. They are outstanding people and very good at what they do.

Dr. Bernie Bach, resident of 1029 Franklin Avenue, River Forest and had resided in Oak Park, noted his experience with working with OPRFHS and that the fact that he had played a major role in identifying the premium company that would provide training care to the high school. In the Chicagoland area, there are a number of physical therapists and training companies, and big companies that provide wonderful care. AthletiCo is the preferred trainer of his orthopedic group. The most important point is trust. Students must trust the adults, supervisors, and trainers. He has witnessed a very strong relationship between trainers and students and between the trainers and the coaches, and he never saw a football coach question a trainer's decision to hold a student out of a game. Athletic trainers, in general, are very hard working and whoever is selected will work hard, but one cannot put a price on Dave and Shannon; he responds to their questions at all times. He supported AthletiCo.

Chris Ledbetter, Head baseball coach, noted that the trainers have become friends, the students trust them and they give quality care. While any training company putting in a bid and passed the reference test would offer quality care; AthletiCo trainers never refer out PT. The money the high school may save in accepting a lower bid is just passing the price on to the parents. Students having PT with Dave and Sharon allow them not to miss time with the team or by traveling to off-campus sites. He personally trusted these trainers.

Donna Weigel, resident of 170 N. Elmwood, Oak Park, parent of 5 children (four graduates, one freshman and all athletes). Her husband coaches JV Field Hockey and is a cardiologist. Dave and Shannon are competitive on an emotional and professional level. There is a mutual respect between the coaches and the trainers and the trainers and the students. It would be a great disservice for athletes and coaches if they were to leave.

Jason Bannack, representative of AthletiCo, noted that OPRFHS was one of the first agreements he brought to the AthletiCo family. He had worked with John Stelzer and promised that OPRFHS would receive the services, skill sets, and the personalities that the OPRFHS family would embrace. AthletiCo kept its promise from day one. AthletiCo covers 68 high schools. It is one of the 2012 top places to work in Chicago, as well as other cities in the country. AthletiCo will continue to support Chicago as well as other work places in the country. It has and will continue to support extracurricular programs. He thanked those who supported AthletiCo that evening.

Tim Weinard, resident of 630 S. Kenilworth, Oak Park, spoke in support of the trainers. His daughter had sustained a concussion during a softball game, preventing her from further playing. While that was an unpopular decision, she asked him to support them this evening. They are very professional.

Mike Powell, teacher, coach, stated that there were over 100 years of athletic coaching experience in the room. He stated that the trainers were the two best with whom he has worked; they handle the coaches and the students well. OPRFHS must not put a price on human stories. The trainers are an important part of the athletic family who work very well together. It would be a huge loss to the school.

Presentation of Athletic Trainer RFP

The Business Office's recommendation was to accept the RFP for Athletic Training Services with NovaCare at the regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting. The term of this contract is from June 10, 2013 to June 15, 2016.

Mr. Johnson explicitly detailed the RFP bid process, including the opening bid proposals, the process used to ensure that the services bid upon were the same for each company as presently provided by AthletiCo, the research and analysis, reference feedback, the scoring matrix, and the cost comparison. NovaCare's proposal was \$82,166.43 less for three years than what is currently being paid. While OPRFHS had reached out to two other companies about submitting a proposal, ATI and Accelerated, Accelerated said it did not want to go through the process and ATI did not submit a proposal. The scoring matrix was weighted as follows: 50% on cost, 20% on technical abilities, and 30% on services provided. NovaCare received a score of 84 and AthletiCo received a score of 83.5. The District investigated why NovaCare's fees were lower and questioned its experience. In an interview, NovaCare stated it was just entering the Chicagoland market, its focus was on service, and it was building its portfolio one high school at a time. Both companies had received excellent reference feedback. NovaCare would hire trainers for this position and both the Athletic Director and Assistant Athletic Director would be involved in the process.

Initially there was a \$72,000 annual difference in the proposals. AthletiCo was asked to review its proposal and did so on April 5. Its resubmitted proposal was \$42,000 less. NovaCare had the same opportunity and submitted a revised proposal of \$114,000 for the three-year contract. A concern was raised by a Board member about the validity of the process, as the Athletic Director, who participated in the process, did not support the recommendation.

In response to a question about experience, Ms. Karadsheh stated that NovaCare holds the same standards as does AthletiCo. Trust is the most important element. When trainers are hired, it is reiterated that they are providing a service. Currently, NovaCare has staff at DePaul, University of Illinois of Chicago, and Loyola. NovaCare is a national company. She, too, is a trainer and it was common for her to work 80 hours per week, without additional pay; that is the expectation for the trainers with their current contracts. During the discussion with OPRFHS, the hiring of the AthletiCo trainers was discussed. Ms. Karadsheh stated that it would be their decision whether they wanted to go through the hiring process. NovaCare would not approach other trainers. NovaCare currently had locations at Rush Hospital and the Oak Park FFC. It too is invested in the community and it wants a chance to grow the company. NovaCare lowered its bid a second time because it was excited about the opportunity and wanted to secure it. NovaCare currently has physical therapists that live in the community.

Outsourcing these positions was a cost savings to OPRFHS. This contract is similar to that of the one OPRFHS has with Thrive Counseling. AthletiCo trainers were committed to the community; one's spouse was student teaching at one of the junior high schools.

When asked why AthletiCo had readjusted its proposal and if the high school had paid too much the last three years, AthletiCo responded that it has two committed individuals. The cost of putting someone at the high school is substantial. Besides the salary they receive, they also receive annual increases, benefits, continuing education, performance appraisals, bonuses, etc., which amount to more than \$100,000. OPRFHS is receiving a significant discount at \$65,000 for two trainers. AthletiCo has created a relationship with OPRFHS and that was the reason for not increasing cost. AthletiCo loses money every year it is at the high school. Quality of care is the most important factor. AthletiCo creates brand awareness through the care of athletes and it recoups some of its costs by the private use of its athletic facilities. Ms. Rowe negotiates contracts and coordinators special events for AthletiCo. The standard rate for trainers at special events is between \$30 and \$35 per hour. The past contract with OPRFHS provides services at \$22 per hour. AthletiCo dropped now its price because it wants to be competitive and stay at the high school. While AthletiCo's rate was fair in the past, more competition exists; it occurs in many businesses.

The Business Office will respond later to: 1) how many hours the trainers were on site and working; 2) how much of the \$65,000 was an hourly rate for additional services? 3) What was the total amount for services? 4) How are the extra hours of services figured into this pricing? Currently, the high school has not been billed for any additional hours during the 3-year contract. This contract is for approximately 2,500 hours per year or 30 hours per week per trainer.

When asked if services were provided that were above and beyond what was included in contract RFP, Mr. Stelzer responded that the RFP did not reflect additional hours of parental communication, which was based on the services provided for the last seven years, because it is not tracked. The expectations include communication, which is considered value-added services.

Mr. Phelan thanked the Business Office and Ms. Witham for their diligent efforts to keep costs and expenses low. He also appreciated the presence of the NovaCare representative. He had been a recipient of AthletiCo's value-added services as his daughter was diagnosed with a serious blood disease and Shannon, one of the trainers, offered to do a bone marrow drive in his daughter's name. He was impressed with the comments stated by the parents and coaches. The trainers are part of the community and the high school is able to pay a premium for their services. AthletiCo had become part of the community and had gone beyond what was expected. He was a vocal advocate.

Dr. Lee felt the issue was whether to rely on people who were well liked, respected, trusted, and friends. He likened it to politicians giving contracts to friends. He found this a good, but difficult discussion.

Mr. Finnegan echoed Mr. Phelan's comments, thanking the Business Office for its diligence and speed. He was happy that this Board of Education was making this decision. OPRFHS has two great choices; one company wants to work with OPRFHS and one that is a premium company has ties to Oak Park and River Forest and knows the community. He did not want to lose that relationship. He too spoke about his positive personal experience with AthletiCo.

Ms. McCormack noted that one of the most important issues as a Board of Education member has been to make sure that at every turn it is taking into account the best interest of students. She spoke about the experiences of her son and daughter. Her daughter had been hurt in her first high school game and was not able to participate until the last game. The trainers worked to keep her engaged so that she did not lose sight of being on a team. Her son experienced a very serious back injury as a football player and the trainer showed up unexpectedly at his doctor's appointment. These trainers have built relationships over the years and add value to institutional knowledge. She believed that keeping the contract in place with AthletiCo was the best for students.

Dr. Millard noted that the Board of Education was not comparing apples to apples. The scoring matrix showed that AthletiCo was the winner; the only different was in the dollars.

Ms. McCormack thanked all for their comments. The Board of Education would take action on a contract April 25, 2013.

At 10:02 p.m., the committee recessed its meeting and resumed at 10:08 p.m. in the Board Room.

Presentation of Food Service Rollover Bids – Distributor, Milk, and Bread

As OPRFHS is the Administrative District for the Northern Illinois Independent Purchasing Cooperation (NIIPC), it is required to perform the necessary functions to obtain bids and awards to a preferred vendor the purchase of food and supply items by individual member districts of the Cooperative, including rollover of all bids/RFPs, etc.

As such, it was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend that the Board of Education approve the vendor information presented in the report dated April 16, 2013, as the Administrative District, at its April 25, 2013 regular Board of Education meeting.

The Primary Vendor Contract is with Performance Foodservice of Fox River. The Bread Supplier Rollover Companies are Alpha Baking and Sara Lee Baking. The Daily products Supplier Rollover Bids are: Bob’ Dairy, Cloverleaf Farms Dairy, ECO-Marigold Dairy, and Muller-Pinehurst Dairy.

Presentation of NIIPC Selected Commercial Products Contract RFP

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend that the Board of Education approve the individual vendors as specified below at its April 25, 2013 regular Board of Education meeting.

The NIIPC evaluation team reviewed all proposals and an established scoring system was applied to all qualified proposals. Points were given for easy access to online nutritional information, complete and accurate submission of items specified, accurate calculations, and extensions of quoted prices and cost. The cost score was computed by dividing the vendor’s total cost of services into the lowest total cost of all bids and then multiplying by the maximum score for price.

The recommendations for awards are as follows:

Hillshire Brands,	Corn Dog Products
Spring-Fil Ind (Jobguard)	glove products
Kelly Eisenberg.	Hot dog products
Kellogg’s	96 ct. -1 grain cereal
General Mills	60 ct. – 2 grain and bulk cereal
Milwaukee Center For Independence	breakfast bags with cereal
Notables	shelf stable breakfast bags without cereal
East Side Entrees	refrigerated/frozen Breakfast Bags without cereal
Bakecrafters	biscuits and rolls
Echo Lake	bulk individual pancakes and waffles
General Mills	individually wrapped mini pancakes and waffles
Citrus Systems	4oz. and 6oz. juice cups
Country Pure	all shelf-stable juice box products
Absopure	all sizes of unflavored water
Nestle	all 16oz. flavored water
Health Fusion	all 8oz. flavored water
Dannon	4oz. yogurt

General Mills	6oz. yogurt
Upstate Niagara	8oz. yogurt and bulk yogurt
Chobani	4oz. and 6oz. Greek yogurt

Presentation of Audit Engagement Letter

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the audit engagement letter from Baker Tilly Virchow Krause, LLP at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting. This letter provides the terms and objectives and the nature of the services Baker Tilly will provide to the District. This is the second year of a three-year contract with Baker Tilly.

Presentation of 2014 Summer Maintenance Construction Projects

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the summer 2014 construction projects at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting. Mr. Zummallen shared a PowerPoint presentation so that the Committee could visually see the areas to be affected.

The list of project includes:

1. Exterior Masonry Restoration
2. Renovation of men’s bathrooms in old building
3. Wrestling locker room renovations
4. Girls’ Freshman/Sophomore locker rooms
5. ET IDF Closets Phase II
6. 4th floor tile abatement and replacement to Fritz tile
7. Stairway ceilings and lights in new building
8. VAV replacements with ceiling and lights (various locations)
9. Replace air handling units F-2, F-3, F-5, G1, X 10
10. Miscellaneous asbestos work on piping to air handlers and bathrooms.

Although the long-term plans identify some of the areas that might be altered, it was worthwhile to change the ceiling lighting on the first floor, as it would affect the teaching environment greatly. The technology enhancements would not be affected by alternative recommendations for the spaces. It was clarified that after summer 2014, all the flooring tiles in the hallways containing asbestos would be removed.

Presentation of Pekron Consulting Contract for 2014

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the contract with Pekron Consulting for summer 2014 construction at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting. The District has employed Pekron Consulting as its environmental consultant since 2010. Pekron has been professional, knowledgeable and an asset to the District. The cost of this contract is consistent with previous years.

Presentation of Pilgrim Parking Lot Contract

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it accept the contract with Pilgrim Church for a three-year period at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting. The District rents the Pilgrim Church parking lot as part of the overall parking plan for faculty and staff during the school year. The Garage Intergovernmental Agree with the Village of Oak Park requires OPRFHS to maintain the parking relationship with Pilgrim in order to reduce parking congestion in the neighborhood surrounding the high school.

Presentation of Athletic and Activity Stipends FY 2014

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the Athletic and Activity Stipend positions and budget for the 2013-14 school year at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting.

The Board of Education annually approves the FTE for Athletic and Activity positions and the budget amount for the total costs of stipends paid to personnel for performing in these programs. The stipends are determined by the collective bargaining agreement between the Board of Education and the Faculty Senate.

Presentation of Contract with Ombudsman

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the contract for alternative educational services with Ombudsman for the 2013-4 school year at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting. This contract reserves 10 slots at a cost of \$5,880 per student. Pupil Support Services (PSS) Teams refers students to this nontraditional school setting in an effort to reduce dropout rates, increase graduation rates, increase attendance levels, and improve academic performance.

Discussion of Board of Education Budget

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve its budget as presented for the 2013-14 school year at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting.

Presentation of Monthly Financial Report

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the Monthly Financial Report at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting under the Consent portion of the agenda.

Presentation of Monthly Treasurer's Report

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the Monthly Treasurer's Report at its regular April 25, 2013 Board of Education meeting under the Consent portion of the agenda.

Presentation of Check Disbursements dated April 16, 2013

It was the consensus of the Finance Committee members to recommend to the Board of Education that it approve the Check Disbursements dated April 16, 2013, at the Special Board of Education meeting immediately following this meeting.

Collaboration of Early Childhood Care & Education Agreements

It was the consensus of the majority of the Finance Committee members to recommend that the Board of Education approve the Intergovernmental Agreement and the Contract for Services with the Early Childhood Care and Education at the Special Board Meeting scheduled for Wednesday, April 24, 2013 at the high school at 7:00 p.m.

Mr. Phelan explained that the Board of Education had solicited comments from Board members in advance of this meeting regarding the agreements. Ms. Patchak-Layman and Dr. Millard submitted comments. Mr. Phelan and Ms. Fisher hoped for an up or down vote on the contracts presented. The contracts as presented contained an annual op-out clause, which allows any one of the parties to end the contract. So, because of the logistics of getting the three parties together and the inclusion of the opt-out language giving all three parties the incentive to make sure they were comfortable with the arrangement going forward, a decision was made not to go through the contracts item by item. Mr. Phelan explained that the proposal was to take the agreements as presented and vote on them at the Tri-Board meeting.

Ms. Patchak-Layman stated:

1. It should be a 3- year contract; generally, the high school does not engage in 5-year contracts;
2. A second 3-year contract should include goals and benchmarks in order to know the services being provided and the accountability measure that comes with financial commitment.
3. All percentages now occur in the fourth and fifth year and are not specific. Specifics were available through the start up with the employees hired and what they do.

4. Not listing specific activities as to what should be happening is a disservice to the Collaboration
5. The contract should not automatically renew.

Ms. Fisher noted the awareness that the makeup of the Board of Education was about to change. The intent of the IGA too was to allow easier access to other governmental bodies to joining this Agreement or contract for services, as it is a challenging issue, as the District may not see direct results. She interpreted this contract as an annual term. If the Board of Education feels information is insufficient or not valuable, it can release itself from the contract after each year. The Collaboration is very aware of the pressure to provide the three contract parties information. Ms. Fisher was satisfied that this Board of Education was approving only a \$216,000 commitment, because the Board of Education could end the relationship after one year. Mr. Phelan added that the three parties recognized that an administrative entity or working group should be created in order to have the checks and balances necessary and to meet the needs of the three parties going forward, especially in the first three years of the agreement. A one-year opt-out provided this Board of Education with the most flexibility. It is not just a dispute resolution, but also an unqualified right to opt out at any time. The administrative entity gives direction as to the appropriate receipt of those services, the money paid for the services, and the protection for this Board of Education to move forward and that the Board of Education had voted unanimously to do that.

Mr. Finnegan added that the Collaboration now has every incentive to make this work and time to run properly. It will allow other taxing bodies to come into the structure at their levels. He acknowledged that this was a leap of faith. While OPRFHS has not taken the lead on many things, it did on this. It is a unique model that is fair to the boards of education yet to be. The time of Mr. Phelan, Ms. Fisher, and Dr. Isoye on this endeavor was appreciated.

While Dr. Lee too expressed a concern about the five-year length, after reading both documents in detail he concluded that there was enough flexibility to make it work. He put his faith in that fact.

Dr. Millard shared Ms. Patchak-Layman's concerns about not having definite data until the end of contract in 2016. This is a leap of faith; it is significant money. She was worried about the "unstated" expenses/hidden costs, etc. Mr. Phelan noted that the entities had talked about expenses and it was decided that the administrative district could include this audit in its own annual audit. Other expenditures were not anticipated. If an administrative district abuses its authority, it runs the risk of destroying the entire project. Ms. Fisher noted that the four parties were very motivated to make this work. She felt that the Village, District 200, and District 97 wanted a way to come together and be successful. The cost of an audit is not an obstacle. The collaboration was willing to address the concerns, motivated to talk about the importance of continuing to bring in other governmental entities and they will continue that effort. This agreement is the best of all worlds and if not, OPRFHS has an opt-out.

Adjournment

Ms. McCormack adjourned the Finance Committee meeting at 11:12 p.m.

Terry Finnegan
President

Amy McCormack
Secretary